

GREATER MANCHESTER COMBINED AUTHORITY

DATE: Friday, 31st January, 2020

TIME: 11.30 am

VENUE: Guardsman Tony Downes House, Manchester Road, Droylsden,
M43 6SF

SUPPLEMENTAL AGENDA

- 4.C Minutes of the Audit Committee held on 21 January 2020 (attached)** 1 - 6
To note the minutes of the Audit Committee held on 21 January 2020.
- 4.D Minutes of the GM Transport Committee held on 17 January 2020 (attached)** 7 - 18
To note the minutes of the GM Transport Committee held on 17 January 2020.
- 4.E Minutes of the GM Local Enterprise Partnership Board held on 21 January 2020 (attached)** 19 - 26
To note the minutes of the GM Local Enterprise Partnership Board held on 21 January 2020.

BOLTON	MANCHESTER	ROCHDALE	STOCKPORT	TRAFFORD
BURY	OLDHAM	SALFORD	TAMESIDE	WIGAN

Please note that this meeting will be livestreamed via www.greatermanchester-ca.gov.uk, please speak to a Governance Officer before the meeting should you not wish to consent to being included in this recording.

Membership 2019/20

Name	Organisation	Political Party
GM Mayor Andy Burnham	GMCA	Labour
Councillor David Greenhalgh	Bolton Council	Conservative
Councillor David Jones	Bury Council	Labour
Councillor Brenda Warrington	Tameside	Labour
Councillor Richard Leese	Manchester CC	Labour
Councillor Sean Fielding	Oldham MBC	Labour
Councillor Allen Brett	Rochdale	Labour
City Mayor Paul Dennett	Salford City Council	Labour
Councillor Andrew Western	Trafford	Labour
Councillor David Molyneux	Wigan Council	Labour
Councillor Elise Wilson	Stockport MBC	Labour

For copies of papers and further information on this meeting please refer to the website www.greatermanchester-ca.gov.uk. Alternatively, contact the following
Governance & Scrutiny Officer: Governance and Scrutiny
✉ sylvia.welsh@greatermanchester-ca.gov.uk

This agenda was issued on 27 January 2020 on behalf of Julie Connor, Secretary to the
Greater Manchester Combined Authority, Churchgate House, 56 Oxford Street,
Manchester M1 6EU

MINUTES OF THE GREATER MANCHESTER COMBINED AUTHORITY AUDIT COMMITTEE, HELD ON TUESDAY 21 JANUARY 2020 AT MECHANICS INSTITUTE, MANCHESTER

PRESENT:

Gwyn Griffiths (Chair)	Independent Member
Councillor Mary Whitby	Bury Council
Councillor Sarah Russell	Manchester City Council
Councillor Colin McLaren	Oldham Council
Councillor Tom McGee	Stockport Council
Councillor Chris Boyes	Trafford Council
Catherine Scivier	Independent Member
Grenville Page	Independent Member
Susan Webster	Independent Member

ALSO PRESENT:

Daniel Watson	Mazars External Auditor
Mark Dalton	Mazars External Auditor

OFFICERS:

Steve Wilson	GMCA Treasurer
Sarah Horseman	GMCA Audit and Assurance
Damian Jarvis	GMCA Internal Audit
Helen Fountain	GMCA Treasury
Lindsey Keech	GMCA Treasury
Andrea Heffernan	GMF&RS Finance
Steve Annette	GMCA Governance and Scrutiny
Matt Berry	GMCA Governance and Scrutiny

AC/01/20 APOLOGIES

RESOLVED /-

No apologies were received

AC/02/20 CHAIRS ANNOUNCEMENTS AND URGENT BUSINESS

There were no chairs announcements or urgent business. The Chair welcomed Steve Wilson, the newly appointed GMCA Treasurer, and both Grenville Page and Susan Webster the newly appointed Independent Members to the Audit Committee.

AC/03/20 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

RESOLVED /-

There were no items of personal or prejudicial interests declared in relation to any item on the agenda.

AC/04/20 MINUTES OF THE GMCA AUDIT COMMITTEE MEETING HELD ON 9 OCTOBER 2019

RESOLVED/-

That the minutes of the meeting of the GMCA Audit Committee held on 9 October 2019, be approved as a correct record.

AC/05/20 MINUTES OF THE GMCA/GMP JOINT AUDIT PANEL

For the benefit of the newly appointed independent members, the Chair explained the devolved arrangements that were in place to scrutinise GMP's accounts and procedures and the role of the GMP Joint Audit Panel. He added that as part of the recent recruitment drive a further independent member had been appointed to the GMP Joint Audit Panel.

Sarah Horseman, Head of Audit and Assurance, added that it was important to note the GMP Police Audit Panel does have regular conversations on matters that appear on the Corporate Risk Register, and cited iOPS as a prime example.

RESOLVED/-

That the minutes of the Joint Audit panel held on 23 October 2019 be noted.

AC/06/20 CORPORATE RISK REGISTER UPDATE

Sarah Horseman, Head of Audit and Assurance, introduced a report that provided Members with the latest quarterly update of the Corporate Risk Register for their review.

The process for review and update of the Corporate Risk Register (CRR) was updated to Members. There is good engagement through the Governance and Risk Group and input from SMT in the process. . It was highlighted that risk descriptions, status and action plans are being challenged as part of the process and significant changes highlighted. It was noted that as well as the process for updating the CRR , there is also a general aim to do more work to review how operational risks are being managed at service level. It was stated that reviewing this item by this Committee would enable Members to have oversight of all of the strategic risks individually.

Members were informed that there has been no major change to the risk landscape with 20-recorded risks, including one new risk on Climate Change, which was noted as a 'medium' rated risk. In response to Member questions, It was confirmed that there is currently formal process for articulating risk appetite at a detailed level (for example financial, health and safety) for GMCA against which specific risk types would be managed. The Head of Audit and

Assurance has taken responsibility for Risk Management and this would be addressed during 2020/21 as part of the development of the GMCA Risk strategy and policy.

It was clarified to Members that in relation to table 3.6, that there are no risks currently recorded under the thematic area of 'Statutory and Compliance' on the CRR. However, there may be risks being managed at a service level. It was also confirmed that GMP have their own organisational risk register.

Following Members reviewing all of the risks individually, the following points were made:

Brexit

Audit committee had some concerns around the Brexit risk assessment being downgraded. Members questioned what mitigation has been put in place for import / exporting arrangements. Members felt that the bigger economic risks to GM remain in place, and wished to feedback these concerns back.

CSE Independent Review

Members felt that following the publication of the report, the focus should be on understanding the adequacy of actions being taken in response to the report and case learning.

Finance and Resources

Members expressed concern around the lack of GMCA Capital Programming/ Treasury Management function and requested an update on revised timescales for this. It was noted that there had previously been issues in GM where grant funding has not been spent in time and had been subject to clawback. It was noted that unspent capital funding is often reallocated across different capital schemes to reduce borrowings. Steve Wilson reported that he will bring a paper to a future meeting which will provide further explanation on this.

Members also expressed the severity of impacts of not managing to utilise funding whilst some GM residents are struggling with financial hardship, highlighting the importance of this risk.

Governance and Organisation

Members enquired around GMCA staff knowledge on Information security and it was confirmed that IT security training was being rolled out to all staff including specific tests to target susceptibility to 'phishing' attacks. The lack of organisation wide BC plan was noted, which was highlighted as a concern.

Members requested a specific timescale be set for update/completion of the GMCA Contracts Register.

External facing Digital Strategy:

Members asked to note there has been a change in lead Chief Executive and Elected member lead for this area.

Member generally noted that there were a number of references to deadlines throughout the document that have passed, requiring update.

Greater Manchester Spatial Framework

Members discussed the consultation for both the GMSF and the bus franchising proposal and debated the level of responsiveness to this process, particularly around governance arrangements.

Climate Change

Members expressed concern around GM being yet to start retrofitting 61,000 homes per year, which now creates a backlog to achieve targets. It was agreed that there is a need to galvanise activity.

Members made the point that there is currently a growing movement amongst young people with whom feel disillusioned and unengaged with current civic/political leadership with this presenting a different type of reputation damage risk to authorities and local government.

Members requested that all actionable items within the CRR be allocated realistic timescales for completion to allow them to be monitored. Members also commented that the potential impact of reputational risks to GMCA should receive greater acknowledgement in the risk register.

RESOLVED/-

That the update on the GMCA Corporate Risk Register be noted.

AC/07/20 INTERNAL AUDIT PROGRESS REPORT

Sarah Horseman, Head of Audit and Assurance presented a report which provided Members with an update of the progress to date in the delivery of the Internal Audit Plan. She reported that the Audit team had recruited two Principal Auditors and the new structure will be fully resourced from 1 March 2020. There were two final published audit reports issued since the last meeting which are GM Troubled Families Programme and ICT Strategy, Governance and Programme Management and several audits at fieldwork stage.

Members discussed the options around format of audit reports and papers that require submitting to Audit Committee meetings that may have sensitivity implications, and whether these should be summarised into an Executive Summary.

Action: It was agreed that a small task group of this committee including the Chair and Cllr Russell will take this offline and review/decide a way forward for sharing audit papers by reviewing implications of the full audit report and its consumption.

Members were updated on the changes to the audit plan i noted in appendix C and that a description of assurance levels is now included as requested. The emergent 2020/21 plan will come to this Committee in April.

Members enquired to what extent internal audit is sitting alongside portfolio areas and supporting in the development of key initiatives such as the Digital strategy and Housing and Planning agenda. . It was clarified that the plan next year would seek to include a balance of both assurance reviews and advisory work.

RESOLVED/-

That the report be noted.

AC/08/20 AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS MONITORING

Steve Wilson , GMCA Treasurer introduced a report which provided an update to Members on the progress to date in implementing the agreed actions from internal and external audit assignments and provided assurance that a robust process was in place for follow up of recommendations.

It was noted that more audit follow up work on validating implementation rates will be undertaken in the coming year, particularly around critical and major findings and actions. t. Members wanted items to be highlighted for critical issues.

It was recommended that management should provide assurance updates on progress of significant audit recommendations to SMT for them to monitor alongside Internal Audit.

It was also stated that Members may seek further assurance over the ongoing timeline for the procurement service review and contract activity. Members specifically asked about the use of procurement waivers and general awareness in the organisation. It was clarified to Members that a Register of key decisions is in place and Internal Audit guidance had been issued on procurement waiver usage and greater transparency

RESOLVED/-

That the Audit Recommendations Monitoring report be noted.

AC/09/20 GMCA TREASURY MANAGEMENT STRATEGY STATEMENT, BORROWING LIMITS AND ANNUAL INVESTMENT STRATEGY 2020/21

Steve Wilson, GMCA Treasurer introduced a report that set out the proposed Treasury Management Strategy Statement, Borrowing Limits and prudential Indicators for 2020/21 to 2022/23 for the GMCA. The Strategy reflects the planned 2020/21 capital programmes for GMCA transport, economic development, Fire, Police and Waste.

Members were updated that there are only minor changes to the paper. It was noted that priority update was to include in the recommendations, that in the event of an immediate crisis that requires action, there are measures that can implemented.

It was clarified that generally the GMCA manage cash flow to avoid borrowing, and that when short term borrowing is done, this is rather than using capital fund options. Members enquired around rates for fixed terms or variable external loans and whether there is any governance to validate the loan. It was clarified that this will need to be taken back to be answered at a future meeting.

RESOLVED/-

That the GMCA be recommended to approve the proposed Treasury Management Strategy Statement and Annual Investment Strategy to apply from 1 April, 2020 in particular:

- The Treasury Indicators listed in Appendix A.
- The Minimum Revenue Provision (MRP) Strategy outlined in Appendix A.
- The Treasury Management Policy Statement at Appendix B.
- The Treasury Management Scheme of Delegation at Appendix C.
- The Borrowing Strategy
- The Annual Investment Strategy
- Delegation to the Treasurer to step outside of the investment limits to safeguard the GMCA's position

AC/10/20 ANNUAL AUDIT LETTER - GMCA

Daniel Watson, Mazars External Auditor introduced a report that summarised the work Mazars had undertaken as the auditors for the GMCA for the year ending 31 March 2019.

It was highlighted to Members that this has been a challenging process due to the pack used for this being originally designed for a standard local authority, which doesn't always work for a Combined Authority. It was highlighted that Page 61 highlighted responsibilities, and that there were challenges due to annual accounts not following the same format. Counter party transactions were also noted as usually 'not matching'. The Chair confirmed receipt of the standard terms of conditions.

RESOLVED/-

That the report be noted

AC/11/20 AUDIT COMMITTEE SCHEDULE OF BUSINESS

RESOLVED/-

That the report be noted

MINUTES OF THE GREATER MANCHESTER TRANSPORT COMMITTEE HELD ON FRIDAY 17 JANUARY 2020 AT THE FRIENDS MEETING HOUSE

PRESENT:

Councillor Mark Aldred (in the Chair)	Wigan Council
Councillor Stuart Haslam	Bolton Council
Councillor Beth Mortenson	Bury Council
Councillor Roy Walker	Bury Council
Councillor Sean Fielding	GMCA
Councillor John Leech	Manchester City Council
Councillor Dzidra Noor	Manchester City Council
Councillor Angeliki Stogia	Manchester City Council
Councillor Mohon Ali	Oldham Council
Councillor Shah Wazir	Rochdale Council
Councillor Phil Burke	Rochdale Council
Councillor Roger Jones	Salford City Council
Councillor Angie Clark	Stockport MBC
Councillor David Mellor	Stockport MBC
Councillor Peter Robinson	Tameside Council
Councillor Doreen Dickinson	Tameside Council
Councillor Warren Bray	Tameside Council
Councillor James Wright	Trafford Council
Councillor Nathan Evans	Trafford Council

OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE:

Eamonn Boylan	Chief Executive GMCA & TfGM
Bob Morris	Chief Operating Officer, TfGM
Alison Chew	Interim Head of Bus Services, TfGM
Caroline Whittam	Head of Rail Franchising, TfGM
Alex Cropper	Head of Operations
Nick Roberts	Head of Services & Commercial Development, TfGM
Chris Boardman	GM Cycling and Walking Commissioner
Richard Nickson	Cycling & Walking Programme Director, TfGM
Gwynne Williams	Deputy Monitoring Officer, GMCA
Nicola Ward	Governance Officer, GMCA

GMTC 01/20 APOLOGIES

Resolved /-

That apologies were received and noted from Councillor Steve Adshead, Councillor Joanne Marshall and Councillor Howard Sykes.

GMTC 02/20 CHAIRS ANNOUNCEMENTS AND URGENT BUSINESS

Resolved /-

1. Recent Death of Councillor Guy Harkin

That it be noted that the Members of the GM Transport Committee held a minutes silence to express their condolences to the family of Councillor Guy Harkin, a passionate and active Member of the previous Transport for Greater Manchester Committee who had recently passed away.

2. New Member

That it be noted that Councillor Shah Wazir had been appointed by the GM Mayor to replace Councillor Liam O'Rourke on the GM Transport Committee.

GMTC 03/20 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Resolved /-

That Councillor Phil Burke declared a personal interest in relation to item 6 (Performance Report) as an employee of Metrolink.

GMTC 04/20 MINUTES

Resolved /-

1. That the minutes of the meeting held on 8 November 2019 be approved as a correct record.
2. That in relation to minute GM 58/19 it was confirmed that GMP had established their new Transport Unit which had already been noticeably visible on Metrolink.

GMTC 05/20 TRANSPORT COMMITTEE DRAFT WORK PROGRAMME

Gwynne Williams, Deputy Monitoring Officer for the GMCA took Members through the latest version of the GM Transport Committee Work Programme.

Members were advised that a report on Taxi Licensing Standards would be considered in due course, any urgent comments should be fed directly to their Local Authority as the responsible organisation.

Resolved /-

That the work programme for the GM Transport Committee be noted.

GMTC 06/20 TRANSPORT NETWORK PERFORMANCE

Alex Cropper, Head of Operations TfGM introduced the latest Network Performance report which covered the performance of all modes during November 2019. The report highlighted increased delays on the highway network of 2% above the term time average partly attributed to the seasonal impacts of poor weather, shorter days and city centre events. Metrolink performance was positive across the period, however there was a reported knife incident at the Abraham Moss stop, which the Police were proactively addressing. November was a poor month for rail performance, with declines in both punctuality and reliability measures.

Two key successes for the month had been the highest recorded level of patronage for the Leigh Guided Busway and the successful trial of the shuttle bus service at Manchester United football matches.

A Member thanked TfGM for their support in dealing with antisocial behaviour on the Metrolink Rochdale line, however he reported increased levels of antisocial behaviour from homeless people on trams especially in the Oldham and Manchester area. Furthermore, there had been incidents of fare evasion and aggressive begging, all of which needed to be addressed.

A Member also reported incidents of drug dealing at the Abraham Moss Metrolink Station, and issues with the help point and intercom.

Members discussed the impact of changing football match kick off times to the transport network, and whether there was any action that TfGM could take to mitigate last minute changes. Officers reported that recently a proposed 6pm kick off had been altered due to their objection.

Members expressed their concerns in relation to the further decline of rail services, especially in relation to cancelled, delayed and short formed trains leaving people stranded at stations, and highlighted Ryder Brow, Gorton and Moston as areas experiencing significant issues. Further to this, Members sought assurance that the removal of the pacer trains planned for early 2020 would not have a further negative impact on Northern services.

In relation to the new Metrolink line to Trafford Park, Members expressed the need for the new stations near Old Trafford to have significant health and safety measures to manage the peak times with football visitors. Officers confirmed that lessons learnt from the Ethiad stop had been implemented and measures agreed in conjunction with Trafford Council.

Members were pleased to hear about the continued success of the Guided Busway in Leigh, which was recording patronage levels of over 70,000 passengers per week. The scale of the impact on the public transport network was immense, and its success had to be attributed to high standards of service that should be replicated elsewhere across the network. Members further noted that approximately 25% of those passengers using the Guided Busway had previously been car drivers.

Members reported some challenges for older people in accessing a place to pick up their rail concessionary passes due to a lack of clarity as to the meaning of a 'pay point shop' and asked for communications to be made clearer, and access for collecting passes to be improved.

Resolved /-

1. That the Transport Network Performance Report be noted.
2. That TfGM would review the working status of the help point and intercom at the Abraham Moss Metrolink Station, and report back directly to Cllr Hassan.

GMTC 07/20 RAIL PERFORMANCE REPORT

Bob Morris, Chief Operating Officer TfGM took Members through a report which provided a summary of rail network performance across Greater Manchester over the period from 21 July – 7 December 2019. He reported that performance had continued to decline over this period, and the introduction of the new timetables had not sustained improved resilience or train reliability. Train Operators had reported issues with rolling stock, crew levels and training schedules, all of which had further negative impact on train performance.

Chris Jackson, Regional Director for Northern Rail described unprecedented levels of change for the company, but he could now report that training for drivers and conductors on the new trains was 2/3 complete, and after 18 months of negotiations with the unions, Sunday services would soon be reinstated. Throughout 2019 there had been many issues to contend with, including delays to the production of new trains, late delivery of proposed infrastructure, delays to electrification of the lines, and congestion across the city, all of which added to the challenge faced by Northern Rail. Throughout 2019 there were 59 Pacer trains removed, and 62 new trains introduced. By March 2020 there would be additional electric/diesel trains on the network to further help to improve the service. Other improvements had included investment to the Wigan Springs Branch and a new shed at Newton Heath. With respect to the December timetable changes, Northern reported improved capacity on the Bolton corridor specifically, and further stabilisation of performance had been evident since the beginning of 2020.

Kathryn O'Brien, Customer Experience Director for Transpennine Express confirmed that their performance had been unacceptable and had been a result of a number of factors including the concurrent introduction of three fleets of new trains as a result of manufacturing delays. This had resulted in significant impact to the availability of drivers due to the requirement for their additional training. Transpennine Express had taken a number of measures to try to counteract this impact, including the introduction of additional diesel trains, prioritising local over some cross country services and providing a compensation scheme for season ticket holders. They reported further new trains would be introduced by May 2020, which was hoped to relieve over-crowding, improve availability and restore customer trust.

Daniel Coles, Network Rail reported high levels of collaboration across all train operators to support the current and planned introduction of new trains and the required infrastructure improvements. However, 2019 had been plagued with extreme weather, both high temperatures, and significantly low temperatures, all of which had had an unprecedented impact on train services. He reported that there had been significant infrastructure improvements undertaken over the Christmas period, including further studies on Platform 13&14 at Manchester Piccadilly to better understand the issues and how to improve the capacity of these platforms. Network Rail fully recognised the importance of small scale improvements for stations or infrastructure having

significant long term gains for passengers.

The Committee impressed the need for train operators to fully understand the impact of their poor performance on people's lives, and shared experiences of residents who had missed appointments, interviews and being awarded contracts all because of train delays. They urged that in addition to the impact on individual lives and businesses that the impact on the GM economy was also recognised.

A Member welcomed the re-introduction of Sunday Services and urged that consideration to services along the Rose Hill line be noted. She further reported particular infrastructure issues with Romiley Train Station due to rain water leakage. Northern reported that additional trains were planned for the Rose Hill line during 2020, and offered to investigate the reported maintenance concerns.

Members reported capacity issues with Transpennine Express services from Greater Manchester to Scotland, often attributed to overhead line problems. Transpennine Express reported that this was a hotspot area often affected by high winds, and work was currently underway to investigate the quality of the steel and if possible find improved solutions. Network Rail added that to improve services to Scotland, improvements to Piccadilly were vital and in support of this a further report on the potential for a platform 15&16 had been prepared for Government in September 2019 and was now awaiting comment.

A member reported that recent station access improvement works undertaken by Northern Rail at Hale Station were unfinished and ugly. Northern Rail offered to review this.

In response to information in the report regarding a 30% increase in staff sickness for Northern over the last period, Members felt that this was disproportionate and needed further explanation.

Members commented that having pacer trains on the network would be better than not enough capacity. In response to comments from Members, Northern agreed to consider whether to keep some pacer trains on over the transition period to minimise the disruption to passengers.

The Committee felt that the impact to driver training as a result of the delayed arrival of new trains was not acceptable as they had been anticipated for a long time. Transpennine Express explained that this impact was inevitable as there was a need for physical access to these trains in order to complete the 20 days of training required per person. Northern Rail added that they too had been required to undertake 11,000 training days over a 9 month period which was beyond the volume that would ever be planned, however only 1/3 of the programme now remained. The Chair added that at every stage of the introduction of new trains there had been delays, and this had compounded the impact on GM residents.

Members urged for the train operators to take some responsibility for the effect on passengers and that passing the blame was unacceptable. All operators acknowledged their responsibility, and reported that the manufacturers had also been held accountable by the Train Minister for the impact of these delays. To mitigate the detriment to passenger relations, all operators had also introduced a compensation scheme for season ticket holders. In addition the 'delay-repay' scheme allowed people who had to buy an alternative ticket as a result of a delay to be compensated.

Members of the Committee spoke on behalf of residents who had reported their experience of

faceless, unsympathetic operators who had introduced fares yet brought about no improvements. They questioned as to whether operators were also facing financial penalties for their poor performance, and were informed that there was a well-established penalty regime (Schedule 8) for service cancellations.

Members expressed their anticipation for improvements following the re-introduction of Sunday services, these would begin on the 26 January 2020.

A Member reported specific issues in relation to the aesthetic appearance of the station at Flowery Field and urged Network Rail to review the location of CCTV cameras to ensure they covered the ticket machines.

In respect of joint ticketing, Members urged that operators look to how they could improve passenger experience through tickets that are transferrable, both within rail and bus services.

Members reported serious concerns regarding the lack of investment in Stockport Train Station which was a hub for high numbers of services, and with some improved capacity could have a significant impact on the wider network. Northern Rail and TfGM both reported that the potential for Stockport Train Station was moving up the political agenda and work was already underway to look at how investment into Stockport could further improve capacity for Piccadilly.

Resolved /-

1. That the Rail Performance Report be noted.
2. That it be noted that following detailed conversations with the unions, from 26 January, Northern would be re-instating their Sunday services timetable.
3. That it be noted that Northern would review the water leakage problems at Romiley Train Station, and report back directly to Cllr Clark.
4. That it be noted that Northern would review the finish of the recent platform access improvements at Hale Station and report back directly to Cllr Evans.
5. That it be noted that Northern would discuss the delays to their new train introduction programme with the Chair in further detail after the meeting.
6. That it be noted that all train operators would forward details of their compensation schemes to Members of the GM Transport Committee.
7. That it be noted that Network Rail would review the status of the foliage and location of the CCTV cameras at Flowery Field Train Station and respond directly to Cllr Robinson.
8. That thanks be noted to Mark Angelucci, TfGM for all his work to support Friends of Stations across GM.

GMTC 08/20 BUS PERFORMANCE REPORT

Alison Chew, Interim Head of Bus Services introduced a report which informed Members of the

performance of the bus network across GM during the period from December 2018 to November 2019. It detailed an overall decline in punctuality, however this was still above the national average. The subsidised network reported only 0.6% lost mileage and an upward trend in passenger satisfaction.

In relation to shared ticketing across operators, a Member raised concern that tickets for services 98 and 71 were no longer transferable across Diamond and Go North West. Officers confirmed that his arrangement ended at the end of 2019 and were no longer interoperable, however System 1 products still allowed for travel across these operators.

A Member asked whether the passenger satisfaction levels included in the report could be broken down to commercial and subsidised services. Officers offered to look at how this, and the impact made from previous decisions for the network could be reported to Members in a way that drew out comparative data.

Members questioned whether the cost per person of the Our Pass scheme had been reviewed, and also whether there had been measures established to determine the success of the scheme. Officers reported that the take up of the scheme had been deemed a success, and within forecasted number, and that further metric information would be brought back for consideration by the Committee.

A Member reported specific issues in complaining to First, as a number of residents had received an acknowledgment to their complaint but then no response. First offered to look into the issues raised and report back.

Thanks were expressed to Brandon Jones, Head of External Relations at First for his work to improve services to Littleborough.

Resolved /-

1. That the Bus Performance Report be noted.
2. That TfGM review the format of the report to include comparative statistics from previous reports to evidence the impact of those decisions taken.
3. That a further report on the outcomes of the initial phase of the Our Pass scheme be brought back to the Transport Committee.
4. That it be noted that First would review comments made in relation to their complaints process and report back directly to Cllr Fielding.

GMTC 09/20 FORTHCOMING CHANGES TO THE BUS NETWORK

Nick Roberts, Head of Services & Commercial Development TfGM introduced a report that informed Members of the changes that had taken place to the bus network since the last meeting of the Committee, and any proposed consequential action to be taken by TfGM.

In relation to service 150, a Member reported that whilst works were being undertaken on the A57, operators were planning to cancel the route between Hyde and the Trafford Centre.

Assurances were given from Stagecoach that once the works were completed, this service would be reinstated, and during the works, 9 additional vehicles would be in operation on other affected routes to mitigate the impact on passengers. The Chair added that TfGM had been asked to review all service changes as a result of roadworks over the past 12 months to check that they had now been restored.

Members were concerned about the impact of the proposed withdrawal of service X41 to the residents of Ramsbottom. Transdev reported that the diversion of the X41 service to Ramsbottom began in April 2018, however, the service had not reached the required capacity to date, with an average of only 75 passengers per week. Alternatives had been provided for the remainder of the route, and residents from Ramsbottom could also use the Metrolink as an alternative.

In response to the planned withdrawal of service 130, Members of the Committee felt this was extremely disappointing and would have a significant impact on a number of communities. It was confirmed that the removal of the GM element of the route was a commercial decision as a result of a financial loss for the last couple of years. Arriva confirmed that they had introduced a series of measures to try and increase patronage, but to no avail. Members urged that options for this route were considered again, as the removal would significantly impact residents attending Macclesfield Hospital, particularly for breast screening appointments as the unit at Stepping Hill Hospital had been closed. Furthermore, there were now no evening services between Manchester and Cheadle.

A Member asked that when looking at the integration of the public transport network, that links to Metrolink were also considered when determining bus routes or changes as per the 130 service. In addition, information should be made available to Members as to how the frequency of a service had been impacted over time, i.e. reduced from 10 minute frequency to 20 minute frequency, but now proposing reduction to 30 minute frequency.

In relation to bus franchising, Members queried as to whether decisions in relation to service subsidies would be put on hold. Officers confirmed that a decision had been taken regarding the proposed future approach to bus services, however through this process flexibility would be required to ensure that commercial decisions could still be taken and supported by the wider network.

A Member reported concerns in relation to the consultation on service 403, as the Crompton ward had a large proportion of elderly residents. The suggestion of service 53 as an alternative was not suitable and further local consideration was required.

Oldham councillors had reported concerns regarding proposals to services 353 and 407 and felt that Local Link as an alternative was not sufficient as there would be many un-served areas, particularly the communities within Delph and Uppermill. Members urged that consideration was given to the terrain within these areas, and that 400m to the nearest bus stop was quite significant if up a steep hill. Furthermore, the planned timetable for the 356 service was not compatible with train services at Greenfield Station.

Resolved /-

1. That the changes to the commercial network and the proposals not to replace the de-registered commercial services as set out in Annex A be noted.

2. That action in respect of changes or de-registered commercial services as set out in Annex A be agreed.
3. That TfGM update Cllr Mortenson on any future options considered for the X41 service.
4. That TfGM review proposals for Service 130 within GM and report back directly to Cllrs Meller, Stogia and Clark.
5. That the proposed action is taken in respect of changes or de-registered commercial services as set out in Annex B subject to panel approval be agreed.
6. That the proposed changes to general subsidised services set out in Annex C be approved.
7. That TfGM review the proposals for Service 403, and report back directly to Cllr Sykes.
8. That TfGM discuss the proposals for Services 353 and 407 with the relevant Oldham Councillors.
9. That TfGM review the 356 timetable to ensure it fits will the Greenfield Train Station timetable.

GMTC 10/20 TRANSPORT AND CLIMATE CHANGE

Simon Warburton, Transport Strategy Director TfGM introduced a report which offered some scene setting for Members regarding the scale of the transport related actions that GM needed and take and influence to meet its ambition to be a carbon neutral city region by 2038. The report highlighted some of the key actions within GM's Five Year Environment Plan, including a significant transport modal shift, a majority of clean engine types and wider investment in public transport and active travel. However, GM were dependent on funding and support from Government in order to accelerate this provision and meet the challenge.

Members raised their concern that the Highways Agency were still not held accountable for their part in the clean air proposals for Greater Manchester, and urged for officers to continue to lobby Government to hold them to account. Officers reported that this had been high on their agenda throughout 2019, and there were plans to continue to lobby Government on a broader based climate change matters that went above and beyond the Clean Air requirements.

Members felt that this was an honest and helpful report as to the current status of carbon neutrality across GM, and impressed the need for urgent investment into the public transport network to encourage a stepped change in the culture of how we travel around the city region. In relation to this, Members urged for parallel work to be undertaken in the energy and building sectors to transform GMs carbon footprint. Officers agreed that transport alone could not meet the target for carbon neutrality, and therefore the Green City Partnership was key to its success.

With regards to the 2040 Delivery Plan, Members of the Committee asked for it to be reviewed in its entirety, as it was felt that the recommendations were not transformative enough, nor had there been significant evidence of action on the ground. In support of this, the spending review asks needed to be very robust as without confirmation of a Clean Air Fund, the support of Government remained uncertain.

Members questioned which roads comprised the Strategic Road Network, officers agreed to circulate further information on this.

In respect of electric vehicle charging points, Members asked for further information on current plans. Officers confirmed that there were currently 160 locations with dual headed points, however proposals within the Clean Air Plan include doubling the provision by 2025, which would be further supported by other EV charging networks.

Resolved /-

1. That the report be noted, in particular the scale of the challenge to reduce carbon emissions from transport for GM to meet its ambition to be a carbon neutral city-region by 2038.
2. That a future report as to how TfGM are moving forward on the climate change agenda be brought back to the Transport Committee.
3. That TfGM circulate further information as to which roads are included within the 'Strategic Road Network' with Members.

GMTC 11/20 STREETS FOR ALL AND MADE TO MOVE PROGRESS UPDATE

Nicola Kane Head of Strategic Planning, Insight and Innovation and Jonathan Marsh, Strategic Planning Manager TfGM introduced a report which provided an update on Greater Manchester's 'Streets for All', designed to tackle a range of issues through one single strategic approach. The culmination of 18 months' work with Local Authorities would be realised in the Streets for All strategic document which was planned to include a set of shared standards. This would be published in summer 2020.

Chris Boardman, GM Cycling and Walking Commissioner and Richard Nickson, Programme Director for Cycling & Walking TfGM, updated Members on the delivery to date of the 'Made to Move' report recommendations. The plans included 1,200m of network to be delivered in the next ten years in order to change the behaviour of residents, where currently 30% of their car journeys were less than 1km and 80% are less than 5km. The GMCA recognised that the urgency for delivery was significant and Leaders had asked for annual action plans to ensure the pace of delivery was maintained, with all Local Authorities having signed up to apply a shared set of standards to all developments within their boroughs.

A third of the network had already been designed, including 6 tranches of schemes being approved and now at varying stages of implementation. The delivery of the final stages of a Cycling and Walking paper for Government was due before the end of January 2020, which would demonstrate GM's strong case for future investment and the potential for delivery at speed.

In support of these ambitions, TfGM were reviewing their training programme to those who delivered cycling and walking schemes in order to speed up the process for delivery and further support the ambitions of the 2040 strategy to reach 1 million cycling or walking journeys per day.

Members commented that delivery on the ground was key as resident expectations for the cycling and walking network were high, and to enable this delivery, the ask of Government needed to be

strong.

In respect of a pipeline of potential further projects, officers confirmed that there were a number of schemes in the pipeline awaiting funding opportunities.

Members were disappointed to see that the road traffic incidents numbers had not reduced as significantly as anticipated, however were assured that a future strategy in partnership with Greater Manchester Police would give more traction to the issue.

Officers highlighted that by 2032 there would be 1 million children in Greater Manchester who deserved a network that ensured they could access other parts of GM safely and efficiently.

In relation to the proposal for a new bike hire scheme, Members asked whether there was a predicted modal shift in people wanting to cycle. Officers confirmed that they had reviewed 22 schemes from across the world, and lessons had been learnt from Mo-bike scheme to ensure that the design of any new scheme would be attractive to people across GM. Furthermore the potential for advertising revenue from such a scheme was being considered.

Resolved /-

1. That the report be noted, in particular the update on Greater Manchester's "Streets for All" approach; and progress in delivering the Cycling and Walking Commissioner's "Made to Move" report recommendations.
2. That a future report on the commercial operation models for Made to Move be brought back to the Transport Committee.

GMTC 12/20 EXCLUSION OF THE PRESS AND PUBLIC

That, under section 100 (A)(4) of the Local Government Act 1972 the press and public should be excluded from the meeting for the following items on business on the grounds that this involved the likely disclosure of exempt information, as set out in the relevant paragraphs of Part 1, Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 and that the public interest in maintaining the exemption outweighed the public interest in disclosing the information.

GMTC 13/20 BUS ANNUAL PERFORMANCE REPORT - PART B

Resolved/

That the report be noted.

This page is intentionally left blank



DRAFT MINUTES OF A MEETING OF THE GREATER MANCHESTER LOCAL ENTERPRISE PARTNERSHIP BOARD HELD AT 16:30 ON TUESDAY 21 JANUARY 2020 AT CHURCHGATE HOUSE, OXFORD ROAD, MANCHESTER

Board Members:

Mike Blackburn (In the Chair)

Lou Cordwell, Lorna Fitzsimons, Fiona Gibson, Amanda Halford, Mo Isap, Sir Richard Leese, Nancy Rothwell, Richard Topliss & Cllr Elise Wilson

Advisors:

Mark Hughes (The Growth Company), Simon Nokes (GMCA), David Rogerson (GMCA), Lee Teasdale (GMCA), and John Wrathmell (GMCA).

In Attendance:

Helen Boyle (Electricity North West), Steve Cox (Electricity North West), Gemma Marsh (GMCA), Lisa O'Loughlin (GM Colleges Group) and Mike Taylor (Electricity North West)

GM LEP/20/01 WELCOME, APOLOGIES AND INTRODUCTIONS

Apologies were received from David Birch, Andy Burnham and Juergen Maier.

GM LEP/20/02 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

No declarations were received.

GM LEP/20/03 MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE BOARD HELD ON 11 NOVEMBER 2019

The Board considered the minutes of the previous meeting, held on 11 November 2019.

It was agreed that the updated LEP Communications Plan be circulated to the Board.

RESOLVED:

That the minutes of the meeting held on 11 November 2019 be approved

STRATEGY

GM LEP/20/04 WORK AND SKILLS STRATEGY DISCUSSION

An update on the Work and Skills Strategy was provided by Gemma Marsh and Mo Isap.

Board Members were advised that five key goals had been set to help focus work on addressing the challenges faced in GM:

- **Quality** – Quality as only judged by Ofsted did not give a true picture of the challenges faced by GMs educators
- **Clear Line of Sight** – Ensuring all people have an incentive to reach their full potential by providing a clear line of sight to opportunities across the region
- **Core Skills & Talent** – Growing a culture whereby residents had the ability to expand and build their talents
- **Supporting People into Work & to Progress** – Supporting people to aspire to whatever they wanted to be with a comprehensive education and skills training offer
- **Increasing Technical Skills** – generating more relevantly skilled individuals to help build on globally competitive strengths and drivers of growth

There were many success stories that could already be celebrated in the GM region. For example, 'Bridge GM' provided an infrastructure for connecting business leaders with local schools. This had proved to be a highly successful approach, with 196 of GM's 234 secondary schools now having a business leader connected. Their role was to go into the schools and provide pupils with insights into the world of work, with a particular emphasis of highlighting aspirational opportunities within GM. To date this had resulted in 475,300 meaningful encounters with over 2,300 businesses, and helped the GM region to be a national leader on careers engagement.

The GMACS website and portal had been developed to put all apprenticeship opportunities in GM front and centre for young people through their careers support. The official launch of the GMACS website and app was due to take place on Tuesday 4th February, with an event led by the GM Mayor. This would build upon all the positive work being done under Bridge GM, and would allow young people from the first year

of secondary school all the way up to 18/19 years old to explore the opportunities within GM.

Looking forward there was a lot that GM could work together to progress as soon as possible, as well as working with Government to deliver our ambitions.

Work was taking place in collaboration with KPMG to develop an interactive policy tool that used the Local Industrial Strategy sectors to establish a better understanding of the job market going forward. It will explore how GM could look in ten years if it continues down the current path to help in further develop a high quality local offer. What for example were the jobs that currently could not be filled, and what would be the jobs of the future (such as 'green jobs').

Comments and Questions

Board Members welcomed this positive news and noted that the take up of apprenticeships could be better. The level of joined up working compared to that seen previously was particularly welcomed.

Lorna Fitzsimons stated that the work taking place was very positive and added that GM did not have control of all of the possible levers it could use. It was asked that Gemma Marsh and her team engage with Lorna to discuss this further.

RESOLVED:/

1. That the update on the Work and Skills Strategy be received.
2. That the Strategy and Policy Team be advised to engage with Lorna Fitzsimons for further discussion.

GM LEP/20/05 PRESENTATION FROM FE COLLEGES

The Chair of the GM Colleges Group Lisa O'Loughlin provided the Board with a presentation on GM Colleges offer to Greater Manchester.

The group had reformed in 2016 following the Area Based Reviews with the intention of finding ways to work together and support the work and skills strategy for GM.

Since then the nine colleges had all been on a positive journey. All were now rated as Ofsted good, providing valuable educational support to all varieties of learners and delivering achievement rates that were within the top 10% nationally.

The colleges group also played a key role in social reform work – supporting the development of over 3,000 high-risk young people every year, and over 1,000 Looked After Children and care leavers each year to achieve qualifications.

Going forward, eight of the nine colleges would be delivering T Levels by 2020/21, including 40-day placements. Considerable work had taken place on a work placement capacity-building pilot, and 25% of the nationally available placements would be provided within GM alone.

GM Colleges Group is developing a new vision for technical education by the year 2030. A place-based skills specialisation pilot would be developed to support the delivery of effective local and city region economic and industrial growth strategies, underpinned by co-created protections and incentives. It would allow the colleges to become experts in particular fields, removing competition and encouraging further joined-up positive collaboration. It was intended that a more developed proposal for this would be in place by March 2020.

Comments and Questions

Board Members asked how geographic access could assured across GM for particular courses.

It was advised that for some areas of specialisation it may be necessary to have two areas of provision to ensure accessibility – studies would take place to look at specific geographic areas where particular skills may be in more demand. Where deemed necessary, teachers would be shared across locations. Collaboration between colleges would also ensure a better distribution of suitably qualified teachers.

The Chair noted the points raised and advised that the GM College Group link up with Mo Isap as the Board's Lead on Education and Future Skills to take the plans forward.

RESOLVED:/

1. That the presentation highlighting the GM College Groups offer to Greater Manchester be received.
2. That GM Colleges Group be advised to engage with Mo Isap as the Board's Education and Future Skills Lead to further develop the proposed collaboration programme.

GM LEP/20/06 GMS OUTCOME AND INDICATORS UPDATE

Simon Nokes presentation a report to the Board that summarised outcome and supporting indicators RAG rated red within the latest six monthly update of the Greater Manchester Strategy (GMS) Implementation Plan and Performance Dashboard.

The Chair asked that the LIS action leaders pick up where they needed to.

RESOLVED:/

1. That the summary of red RAG rated outcome and supporting indicators within the GMS Implementation Plan and Performance Dashboard be noted.
2. That LIS action leaders be asked to pick up where appropriate.

GM LEP/20/07 SOCIAL ENTERPRISE ACTION GROUP

Sir Richard Leese presented a report providing the Board Members with information about the establishment of a Greater Manchester Social Enterprise Advisory Group, including its Terms of Reference and the recruitment process proposed to populate the Group.

The Advisory Group would lay the foundations for the development of a more unified approach to the social enterprise sector, bringing together a broad range of institutions underpinned by a clear definition of social enterprise.

Board Members were advised that an update on the selection made by the recruitment panel for the membership of the Advisory Group would be circulated following the meeting.

Comments and Questions

The Board discussed whether the LEP Board would benefit from new Board members with a social enterprise or cultural specialism as vacancies became available.

RESOLVED:/

1. That the establishment of the Greater Manchester Social Enterprise Advisory Group be noted by the Board.
2. That Board Members be asked to consider the selection made by the recruitment panel for membership of the Advisory Group, due to be circulated after the meeting, to provide comments and endorsement of the recommendations.

PERFORMANCE AND DELIVERY

GM LEP/20/08 ENERGY NORTHWEST PRESENTATION

Electricity North West representatives made a presentation to the Board explaining its role in helping GM to meet its 2038 carbon neutrality target.

Scotland was highlighted as an example of the ability to achieve carbon neutrality in electricity demand and generation. 66% of Scotland's electricity demand was now met by Photovoltaics (PV) and onshore wind. It was considered that a comparable level of demand could also be met in GM but this would require considerable effort and focus.

It was expected that under all scenarios, future energy demand would double – a driving factor in this would be the mass growth and adoption of electric vehicles (EV). Significant studies were underway to understand the nature of EV charging behaviours.

For GM to successfully decarbonise, 40 GM businesses a day would need to decarbonise between now and 2038, and solar panels across the region would be required to reach a 40% target.

Leadership would be required to provide the vision and policy framework to enable and encourage businesses to adopt energy efficiency measures and low carbon technologies and drive behavioural change.

Comments and Questions

Nancy Rothwell advised that a successful Foresight Group discussion had recently taken on the challenges and opportunities of clean growth.

Members asked about the key policy elements that had helped to make a difference in Scotland. It was advised that a study was being undertaken to help inform approach to policy making. In Scotland they had looked particularly closely at planning processes and how restrictions could be removed to move quicker on decarbonisation.

The Chair advised that Chris Oglesby in his role as the Clean Growth lead should be contacted for collaboration.

RESOLVED:/

1. That the presentation on decarbonisation by Electricity North West be received.
2. That Electricity North West engage with Chris Oglesby to develop the clean growth approach

GM LEP/20/09 SIX MONTH GROWTH COMPANY PERFORMANCE

Mark Hughes presented a high-level summary of the Growth Company's performance over the latest six-month reporting period. The report highlighted both positives and negatives for full disclosure to the Board.

Comments and Questions

The Chair noted that there had been a very positive response nationally to the work the Growth Company had been undertaking following the collapse of Thomas Cook.

Future funding was discussed and the need to establish as soon as possible the opportunities that could arise from Brexit and the new Government. The Board agreed that GM has gathered substantial evidence on business support from successfully supporting companies. This could inform conversations with Government on future

devolution and flexibility to the Green Book approach allowing local programmes to better support local enterprise.

The importance of appropriate management and leadership was highlighted including links to the Alison Rose Review.

RESOLVED:/

1. That the Growth Company 6 month performance report 2019/20 be noted.

GOVERNANCE

GM LEP/20/10 LOCAL GROWTH ASSURANCE FRAMEWORK UPDATE

Simon Nokes advised the panel that further guidance from the Department for Transport had been incorporated into an updated Assurance Framework for approval by the Board.

RESOLVED:/

1. That the report be noted.
2. That the updated GM Local Growth Assurance Framework be approved by the Board.

GM LEP/20/11 FEEDBACK FROM OTHER BOARDS

The Chair asked that members undertake a refresh of their Register of Interest.

GM LEP/20/12 FUTURE MEETINGS

The next meeting would be held on 17th March 2020.

This page is intentionally left blank